

POLICY PROPOSAL

2008-2

IPv4 Transfer Policy Proposal



POLICY PROPOSAL 2008-2

History

| | |
|----------------------------|--------------------|
| Introduced on PPML | 11 FEB 08 |
| Designated Formal Proposal | 26 FEB 08 |
| Revised | 7 MAR 08 |
| Staff and Legal Assessment | 21 March 08 |
| Current Version | 7 MAR 08 |

| RIR Activity | Similar Proposal | |
|-----------------|------------------|------------------|
| | AfriNIC | NA |
| | APNIC | Returned to list |
| | LACNIC | NA |
| | RIPE NCC | Under discussion |

Proposal Text In Meeting Packet

<http://www.arin.net/policy/2008-2>

POLICY PROPOSAL 2008-2

Understanding

- Allows an organization to transfer excess IPv4 addresses to an organization with a need for addresses, and creates a listing service.

AC Shepherds

- Scott Leibrand
- Stacy Taylor

POLICY PROPOSAL 2008-2

Staff Assessment

| | |
|--|---------------------------------------|
| <p>Legal: Liability Risk?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">– Risk involved, but less risk than keeping current policy. | <p>Yes, but...</p> |
| <p>Staff Comments: Issues/Concerns?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">– Language: may/should vs. must/will; "business failure" nebulous term, should be removed– Do all resources being transferred have to be re-justified per current policy?– Audit exemption conflicts with RSA | <p>Yes</p> |
| <p>Staff Implementation: Resource Impact?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">– New, and changes to, software and templates– Create the listing service | <p>Moderate (180 days)</p> |

Assessment available at:

<http://lists.arin.net/pipermail/ppml/2008-March/010521.html>

POLICY PROPOSAL 2008-2

PPML Discussion

| Posts | People |
|-------|--------|
| 164 | 36 |

- 7 in favor, 3 against, 2 undecided
- Comments:
 - “I still need to be convinced that a fairly free market is not the best solution.”
 - “You CANNOT have prolonged IPv4 lifespan without an increase in deaggregation. I am completely against this transfer policy proposal...”
 - “Why sell when you can rent and keep collecting cash?”
 - Subtopics: listing service, safe harbor, deaggregation, markets and pricing.

Transfer Policy Poll

12:00 EDT, 31 March thru 12:00 EDT, 3 April 2008 (Total Subscribers 1812)

| Questions | Undecided | Don't care | Yes | No |
|--|------------------|-------------------|------------|-----------|
| Q1 Do you feel a transfer proposal to change the current transfer policy should exist? | 132 | 18 | 96 | 28 |
| Q2 Do you feel that you have been informed enough on the pro's and con's of what a change in the current transfer policy would have in our internet community? | | | 100 | 172 |
| Q3 Do you feel informed enough in general to make a decision regarding a change to the current transfer policy? | | | 103 | 170 |
| Q4 Will you attend the April ARIN meeting in Denver via remote participation? | | | 74 | 218 |
| Q5 Will you attend the April ARIN meeting in Denver in person? | | | 37 | 298 |

POLICY PROPOSAL

2008-2

Presentation & Discussion

