Purpose of Policy Experience Report

- Review existing policies
  - Ambiguous text/Inconsistencies/Gaps/Effectiveness
- Identify areas where new or modified policy may be needed
  - Operational experience
  - Customer feedback
- Provide feedback to community and make recommendations when appropriate
Policies Reviewed

- **NRPM 5**: AS Number Policy

- **NRPM 4.2.3.6**: Reassignments to multihomed downstream customers
NRPM 5: AS Number Policy

Policy text:

“In order to be assigned an AS Number, each requesting organization must provide ARIN with verification that it has one of the following:

- A unique routing policy (its policy differs from its border gateway peers)
- A multihomed site.

AS Numbers are issued based on current need. An organization should request an AS Number only when it is already multi-homed or will immediately become multi-homed.”
NRPM 5: AS Number Policy

Current practice:

• Confirm connectivity with two upstream providers
  – Connectivity contracts, invoices, or address reassignments with the two providers
• Confirm deployment within 30 days

Are these correct given that ASNs are no longer scarce?
NRPM 5: AS Number Policy

Customer Feedback

• 30 days is too short of a timeframe
  – “I want to have everything needed to deploy my multi-homed site 3 months before turning it up.”

• Requirement to have connectivity with two upstream providers immediately is burdensome
  – “I don’t want to spend money on a second connection until I know I have an AS number so I can multi-home.”
  – “I need to have established customer base in order to spend money on a second upstream provider.”
NRPM 5: AS Number Policy

Options:

• Leave existing policy/procedure as-is

• Procedure change
  – Interpret immediate to be longer (90 days? 180 days?)
  – Allow verification by identifying two upstream providers and confirming multi-homing will be turned up with them

• Policy change
  – Insert specific timeframe and verification requirements
NRPM 4.2.3.6: Reassignments to multihomed downstream customers

Policy text:

“This policy allows a downstream customer's multihoming requirement to serve as justification for a /24 reassignment from their upstream ISP, regardless of host requirements.”
NRPM 4.2.3.6: Reassignments to multihomed downstream customers

Networks may be unable to obtain a /24 to multi-home post-depletion

- May be unable to find an ISP willing to assign them a /24 under NRPM 4.2.3.6 due to IPv4 depletion
- No policy to allow the network to obtain a /24 on the transfer market since 4.2.3.6 applies only to ISPs and not to ARIN
NRPM 4.2.3.6: Reassignments to multihomed downstream customers

Customers have expressed frustration with not being able to justify and obtain a /24 based on multi-homing

- “I don’t understand why an ISP can assign me a /24 but ARIN can’t”
- “I can’t use anything smaller than a /24 – you don’t seem to understand that”
- “How am I supposed to multi-home if I cannot obtain a /24?”
NRPM 4.2.3.6: Reassignments to multihomed downstream customers

Options:

• Leave as-is
• Change NRPM section 4 to allow multi-homing to suffice as justification for a /24
  – Would apply to waiting list and transfer requests
• Change NRPM section 8 (Transfers) to allow multi-homing to suffice as justification for a /24
  – Would apply only to transfer requests