

ARIN-2014-5

Remove NRPM Section 7.2 - Lame Delegations

Problem Statement

Section 7.2, asking ARIN to resolve Lame Delegations in in-addr.arpa, was established almost 10 years ago. While there may be real lameness problems in the in-addr.arpa tree, this should no longer be part of ARIN policy for two (and a half) reasons:

1) NRPM should primarily be used to determine when requestors do, and do not, qualify for number resources because that's what ARIN's purpose is relevant to. ARIN is not an operational technical body, and its policy should only regulate activities ARIN is designed to participate in.

1a) We don't put text about how to operate Whois or RWhois or IRR in NRPM, so we should not put in text about how to operate DNS.

2) ARIN has never effectively implemented this. If there's still a need, it should be addressed directly with ARIN management and staff for prioritization.

Policy statement

Remove section 7.2

(Shortest policy statement ever? Might be a tie...)

Staff and Legal assessments

- Staff says this would cause no operational changes since lame delegation checking has been suspended due to software issues ever since we changed over to per-zone DNS management.
- Software issues not as simple as they sound due to lack of a formal definition of a lame server and risk of breaking mostly-working stuff.
- Legal says this policy does not create legal issues

Did this belong in the NRPM in the first place? Does it now?

- 7.2 seems to codify operational practice which is out of scope
- NRPM primarily for determining qualification for address space.
- Never effectively implemented despite being in the NRPM for over 10 years

Further thoughts

Is it a good idea to set the precedent of having parts of the NRPM that are actively and conspicuously ignored?

Either bring the practice in line with the NRPM or bring the NRPM in line with the practice.

Cost in complexity and human capital to do the latter - is this how the community wants ARIN to spend its finite resources?

Discussion / Questions