

ARIN-2013-4

RIR Principles

ARIN-2013-4

- ⊗ **What:** A clear definition of the common principles and goals which guide our community
- ⊗ **Where:** In the ARIN NRPM
 - ⊗ Owned by the community
 - ⊗ Established process for change
- ⊗ **Why:** Clarity and Community Control
 - ⊗ Cleanup of RFC2050 has deprecated the text
 - ⊗ Cut and paste of RFC2050 text resulted in issues
 - ⊗ Some practices have been over taken by events
 - ⊗ Lack of clarity

RIR Principles

⦿ Registration

⦿ Conservation

⦿ Routability

⦿ Stewardship

Registration and Routability

⊗ **Registration:**

- ⊗ Ensuring uniqueness of the number resource, and accurate documentation of who is using it
- ⊗ Wide spread agreement this is the most critical aspect of stewardship
- ⊗ Moved to the first principle in the list

⊗ **Routability:**

- ⊗ The ability to have a routing system that can continue to scale.
- ⊗ Wide spread agreement that we need to consider the future scalability of the Internet system

Conservation Defined

- ⊗ Dictionary.com:

- ⊗ prevention of injury, decay, waste, or loss
- ⊗ the careful utilization of a natural resource in order to prevent depletion

- ⊗ Science Dictionary:

- ⊗ The protection, preservation, management, or restoration of natural environments and the ecological communities that inhabit them. Conservation is generally held to include the management of human use of natural resources for current public benefit and sustainable social and economic utilization.

Sustainability Defined

- ⊗ Sustainability:

- ⊗ the ability to be sustained, supported, upheld, or confirmed
- ⊗ Environmental Science. the quality of not being harmful to the environment or depleting natural resources, and thereby supporting long-term ecological balance: The committee is developing sustainability standards for products that use energy.

- ⊗ Sustainable:

- ⊗ capable of being supported or upheld, as by having its weight borne from below
- ⊗ able to be maintained or kept going, as an action or process: a sustainable negotiation between the two countries.

Conservation vs. Sustainability

⊗ Objection:

- ⊗ *“Conservation only makes sense when ARIN is giving out a virtually free resource from a common pool”*
- ⊗ *“Post ARIN depletion we are talking about sustainability which means getting resources to people who need them”*

⊗ Response:

- ⊗ Sustainability is a property of the resource
- ⊗ Conservation is the act of providing sustainability
- ⊗ We are not conserving only the free pool
 - ⊗ Free pool actually buffer against abuse
- ⊗ IP addresses are a public good
 - ⊗ Stewardship means protection, preservation, and management of the public good – AKA: Conservation.

Stewardship Defined

- ⊗ Dictionary.com:
 - ⊗ the responsible overseeing and protection of something considered worth caring for and preserving: New regulatory changes will result in better stewardship of lands that are crucial for open space and wildlife habitat.

Stewardship in 2013-4

- ⦿ Overarching principle
- ⦿ Requires and allows balancing of other three principles
 - ⦿ Balance different for each resource type
- ⦿ How-to balance all principles in each section is what remainder of NRPM is for – not a goal of these principles

Changing Principles?

- ⊗ **Not** creating new principles
 - ⊗ Putting principles in a place that can be owned and managed by the community
 - ⊗ Putting the principles in a place that can be easily referenced
 - ⊗ Per staff assessment, does not change ARIN practices
- ⊗ If the principles need to be changed, lets first agree on the current principles as they are, and then work from there to change them

Proposed Changes

Minor changes proposed to be made after this meeting.

Section Title

- ⊗ Principles and Goals of the **Internet Registry System**
- ⊗ Principles and Goals of the **American Registry for Internet Numbers (ARIN)**

Stewardship

- ⊗ The principle of stewardship guarantees the application of these principles when managing Internet number resources.
- ⊗ The fundamental purpose of Internet number stewardship is to distribute unique number resources to entities building and operating networks thereby facilitating the growth and sustainability of the Internet for the benefit of all.
- ⊗ It should be noted that the above goals may sometimes be in conflict with each other and with the interests of individual end-users or network operators. Care must be taken to ensure balance with these conflicting goals given the resource availability, relative size of the resource, and number resource specific technical dynamics, for each type of number resource. **For example, Conservation often requires greater consideration in IPv4 address distribution due to the limited size of the address space, Routability has a higher weight for the massive IPv6 address space, and AS numbers place the highest value on Registration because they come from a moderately sized pool and are not subject to aggregation.**

Discussion

ARIN-2013-4
RIR Principles

Draft Policy Text

ARIN-2013-4 v3

Registration

- ⊗ The principle of registration guarantees the uniqueness of Internet number resources.
- ⊗ Provision of this public registry documenting Internet number resource allocation, reallocation, assignment, and reassignment is necessary:
 - a) to ensure uniqueness,
 - b) to provide a contact in case of operational/security problems,
 - c) to provide the transparency required to ensure that Internet number resources are efficiently utilized, and
 - d) to assist in IP allocation studies.

Conservation

- ⊗ The principle of conservation guarantees sustainability of the Internet through efficient utilization of unique number resources.
- ⊗ Due to the requirement for uniqueness, Internet number resources of each type are drawn from a common number space. Conservation of these common number spaces requires that Internet number resources be efficiently distributed to those organizations who have a technical need for them in support of operational networks.

Routability

- ⊗ The principle of routability guarantees that Internet number resources are managed in such a manner that they may be routed on the Internet in a scalable manner.
- ⊗ While routing scalability is necessary to ensure proper operation of Internet routing, allocation or assignment of Internet number resources by ARIN in no way guarantees that those addresses will be routed by any particular network operator.

Stewardship

- ⊗ The principle of stewardship guarantees the application of these principles when managing Internet number resources.
- ⊗ The fundamental purpose of Internet number stewardship is to distribute unique number resources to entities building and operating networks thereby facilitating the growth and sustainability of the Internet for the benefit of all.
- ⊗ It should be noted that the above goals may sometimes be in conflict with each other and with the interests of individual end-users or network operators. Care must be taken to ensure balance with these conflicting goals given the resource availability, relative size of the resource, and number resource specific technical dynamics, for each type of number resource. **For example, Conservation often requires greater consideration in IPv4 address distribution due to the limited size of the address space, Routability has a higher weight for the massive IPv6 address space, and AS numbers place the highest value on Registration because they come from a moderately sized pool and are not subject to aggregation.**