

What's the Problem

- There is really no policy for who is eligible to receive resources from ARIN
- Staff's primary reference for existing operational practice is Section 2.2 – the definition of an RIR
 - Regional Internet Registries (RIRs) are established and authorized by respective regional communities, and recognized by the IANA to serve and represent large geographical regions. The primary role of RIRs is to manage and distribute public Internet address space within their respective regions.
- But this really isn't policy, it's a definition within Policy



What's the Problem - continued

- For the most part, the intent is to formalize existing operational practice into policy
 - But as we talk about the issues it seems we don't necessarily have clear consensus for all the existing operational practices
- Many people assume that they can't use ARIN issued resources outside the ARIN region
 - Nothing in policy clearly says you can or can't
 - But, Section 2.2 is easily interpreted by some to imply you can't



What's the Problem - continued

- From ARIN 31 the Policy Experience report,
 "Some US hosting companies [are] adding [a]
 majority of their customers out of region. [The]
 equipment [is] in ARIN region, but almost all
 [the] customers are out of region"
- From John Curran on PPML, "Since June 2013, there have been 52 requests that would not have been approved under the new policy... which is a bit more than a /11 in total..."
- Is this acceptable to the community?



2013-6 - Current Text

Organizations requesting Internet number resources from ARIN must provide proof that they (1) are an active business entity legally operating within the ARIN service region, and (2) are operating a network located within the ARIN service region. In addition to meeting all other applicable policy requirements, a plurality of new resources requested from ARIN must be justified by technical infrastructure or customers located within the ARIN service region, and any located outside the region must be interconnected to the ARIN service region. The same technical infrastructure or customers cannot be used to justify resources in more than one RIR.

Four Major Parts to the Policy

- 1. Presence within Region, both legal and technical
- 2. Some amount (more than a trivial amount) of resources must be justified from within region, a plurality (or maybe a minimum percentage)
- 3. Out of region use is explicitly allowed, but must be part of an infrastructure interconnected to the region
- 4. The same customers or technical infrastructure can not be used to justify overlapping requests to multiple RIRs



Presence within Region

- "an active business entity legally operating within the ARIN service region"
 - Current operational practice requires "business entity formed within region"
 - This language relaxes policy to allow foreign business entities that are "legally operating within the ARIN service region" to also receive resources
- "operating a network located within the ARIN service region"
 - This is fairly self-explanatory, if you are not operating a network within the ARIN region, why should you be getting any resources from ARIN?



Minimum Justification within Region

- Current text requires a plurality of the resources be justified within the region
 - Original authors text required a majority (50%)
 - Another option is a minimum percentage X, where probably X = 20%
- The location of customers and infrastructure must now be evaluated
 - This is a new requirement
 - There are many issues and corner cases that are created by this new requirement



Plurality vs. Minimum Percentage

- A Plurality standard requires that ARIN issued resources are used within the ARIN region more than they are used in any other region
 - But the totality out of region use could be more than within the region
- A Minimum Percentage would only require more than trivial amount of ARIN issued be used within the ARIN region
 - 20% seems reasonable this is the minimum percentage that could be a Plurality
 - But it would be possible for ARIN issued resources to be mostly used within another single region

Out of Region Use

- This policy explicitly allows out of region use
 - Current lack of clear policy makes the status of out of region use unclear and confusing
 - Many people assume they can only use ARIN resources within the ARIN region, even if this is not the technical superior solution for them or the Internet as a whole
- Out of region use should be interconnected to the region
 - A discrete network within another region should use resources from that region's RIR



Overlapping request to RIRs

- The same customers or technical infrastructure cannot be used to justify overlapping requests to multiple RIRs
 - This is fairly self-explanatory, but there are some corner cases that should be considered
 - This should not prevent a web server or router from having addresses from multiple RIRs at the same time



Other Issues

- Allocations or assignments to Individuals disallowed
 - This is existing operational practice, but should this be changed?
- No intent for retroactive effects
 - The policy does not invalidate any previous allocation made based on good faith information
- The policy is not intended to require an overall plurality, it requires substantial justification of new requests from within the ARIN region
 - And disallows requests that are based solely on needs outside the ARIN region



The BIG Question is

Is using ARIN issued resources almost entirely out of region OK with the community?

Your thoughts please.



Discussion



