

Recommended Draft Policy ARIN-2021-8: Deprecation of the 'Autonomous System Originations' Field

Alicia Trotman & Anita Nikolich, Advisory Council

History



Action	Date
Proposal	7 July 2021
Draft Policy	18 November 2021
Revised	16 December 2021
Revised	13 September 2022
Recommended	26 October 2022

Current Text (26 October 2022)



- **AC Assessment of Conformance with the [Principles of Internet Number Resource Policy](#):**
 - Based on community feedback and Advisory Council (AC) discussion, we motion to move ARIN-2021-8: Deprecation of the 'Autonomous System Originations' Field to Recommended Draft, with the following change to Language: The removal of 'OriginAS' fields from December 31st 2024 to 24 months after board adoption.

Current Text (26 October 2022)



- **Problem Statement:**

- In the last two decades, ARIN has developed multiple services which provide mechanisms for Internet Number Resource holders to publish information about their routing intentions.
- The optional 'OriginAS' field was invented before RPKI existed in practice. At that time, ARIN's Internet Routing Registry (IRR) followed a weak authorization model compared to available and in use today such as RPKI. The 'OriginAS' data was an improvement compared the other mechanisms that were available at that time.

Current Text (26 October 2022)



- However, there are issues with the consumption of the data in the OriginAS field:
 - Consuming the 'OriginAS' field in a high-scale automated pipeline is challenging.
 - The consumer needs to enter into a 'Bulk Whois Data' agreement with ARIN, download a multiple-gigabytes XML file (which is only generated once a day), parse this XML file, and then extract the OriginAS field.
 - Querying objects one-by-one via the HTTPS interface does not scale well.

Current Text (26 October 2022)



- **Policy Statement:**

- Remove Section 3.5 “Autonomous System Originations” of the NRPM in its entirety.
- Remove the ‘OriginAS’ field from the database



- **Staff Understanding**

- ARIN-2021-8 would remove the entirety of ARIN policy surrounding Autonomous System Originations, including guidelines for ARIN's origin AS data collection and publication.



- **Staff Understanding**

- As stated in previous staff and legal reviews, the problem statement identifies issues with efficient access to OriginAS data, but the policy statement proposes elimination of the data altogether, rather than proposing potential solutions to the identified shortcomings. Staff recommends careful consideration of impacted customers and their ability to find alternatives to information contained in the OriginAS field within the stated implementation timeframe.



- **Staff Understanding**

- Staff understands this Draft Policy to have two implementation milestones; one for removal of the policy language, and one for removal of the field and all data contained in that field from ARIN databases. Staff recommends the second be adjusted to two years from adoption rather than a fixed date that may need to adjust as the Draft Policy moves through the PDP.

Staff and Legal Review (5 October 2022)



- **Implementable as Written?:** Yes
- **Impact on ARIN Registry Operations and Services:**
 - Involves removal of fields and database objects of significant scope.
- **Legal Review:** No material legal issue.

Staff and Legal Review (5 October 2022)



- **Implementation Timeframe Estimate:**

- Three months for removal of the policy language. Second timeframe will be followed according to the text, if adopted, but not within fewer than nine months from adoption.

- **Implementation Requirements:**

- Customer education and outreach with appropriate sunseting lead times
- Staff training
- Updates to public documentation
- Updates to internal procedures and guidelines

Community Feedback



"The retirement of OriginAS as a trusted source of data should happen since RPKI is a superior cryptographically secure replacement. That said, for legacy space not covered by an LRSAs, it would be good to have a cryptographically secure source of truth via the ARIN RPKI hierarchy."

"I don't see anything broken here, I just see the possibility of things breaking; this is what has me concerned. The fact is we cannot know what the fallout will be until it happens. Are we willing to take the chance?"

Community Feedback



"The field is not well-formed from a data typing perspective; it's just a text field. Additionally, when you have multiple sources of data, it is easy for those data sources to have different and conflicting data. I believe long term the best thing to do is to eliminate the OriginAS field in favor of more well-formed and authoritative data in ARIN's authenticated IRR and in RPKI."

Questions?
Comments?



QUESTION FOR THE COMMUNITY

Does the community support the policy as currently written?

Thank You

